



Co-funded by the Intelligent Energy Europe
Programme of the European Union

Project Title: Regional and Local public Authorities cooperating in sustainable energy planning through effective multi-level governance models

Acronym: COOPENERGY

Grant Agreement Number: IEE/12/703/

Deliverable	D2.4-Regional review report – ARE Liguria
Associated WP	WP2- Multi-Level Governance Models
Associated Task	Task 2.5
Date Delivered	1 July 2013
Prepared by	ARE LIGURIA
Dissemination Level	Public (PU)



Deliverable D2.4- Regional review report – ARE Liguria



Table of Contents

1. Introduction.....	4
2. COOPENERGY.....	4
3. Overall context in sustainable energy planning:.....	4
4. Main purpose:	5
5. Regional situation in energy planning:.....	6
5.1 General information:	6
➤ Energy planning responsibilities at regional level.....	6
➤ Regional SEAP and Covenant of Mayors:.....	6
5.2 Cooperation between national and regional levels:	7
5.3 Cooperation between regional and local levels:.....	7
6. Synthesis:.....	17
6.1 SWOT analysis:.....	17
6.2 Recommendations for collaborative sustainable energy planning:.....	17

© European Communities, 2013

The information and views set out in this publication are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the official opinion of the European Communities. Neither the European Union institutions and bodies nor any person acting on their behalf may be held responsible for the use which may be made of the information contained therein.

1. Introduction

This document covers the deliverable D2.5 of the COOPENERGY project.

The deliverable is submitted either in English (5-10 pages in an electronic format) or in National language with a 2-3 page summary in English.

Each COOPENERGY regional partner is responsible for delivering this document for its own region.

2. COOPENERGY

The main goal of COOPENERGY is to foster the development of collaboration models in sustainable energy planning between the regional and local public authorities to lead the transition towards low carbon communities and regions.

COOPENERGY aims to mobilize eight (8) regional public authorities to work hand in hand with the local authorities and demonstrate their collaboration by developing Multi-Level Governance (MLG) models that support the creation of mutually beneficial Sustainable Energy Action Plans (SEAP) at regional and local levels and the development of joint actions in energy planning for the successful implementation of SEAPs.

In complement to cooperation in strategic regional energy planning, three (3) **themes of collaboration** were identified as key cross-cutting pillars for the successful definition and implementation of the MLG models. COOPENERGY will focus on these collaboration themes:

- **Financial instruments**
- **Modelling, planning and monitoring tools for decision making**
- **Awareness raising and stakeholder involvement instruments**

3. Overall context in sustainable energy planning

Achieving sustainable energy solutions often requires the development of a number of interrelated measures such as a change in land use, sharing of sustainable energy resources or development of new financial models. Therefore, successful implementation will require coherent and concerted energy planning to bring all the differing strands together at regional and municipality levels. This could include additional support for the development of:

- infrastructure planning at a spatial and network level (covering more than one public authority or region) such as renewable energy networks
- cross boundary renewable energy resource supply chains e.g. wood fuel biomass
- natural resource use planning and conflict management

Deliverable D2.4- Regional review report – ARE Liguria

- comprehensive monitoring of energy use and GHG emissions at regional and local levels to inform development of local SEAPs and business cases
- development of innovative financial mechanisms supporting local actions

Successful implementation is further complicated by the fact that regional SEAPs are often part of a wider plan or strategy involving a greater number of stakeholders, and a longer plan development time. It is therefore imperative at the outset to develop a firm multi-level governance basis for action.

4. Main purpose

Each regional partner will perform an **analysis of the situation in its region** with regards to the implementation of MLG models in **sustainable energy planning** and provide recommendations for further improvements to the planning processes.

It will:

- Analyse if the local and regional needs are addressed in the regional SEAP by interviewing the regional authority and a number of municipalities (at least 3 per region).
- Identify areas of potential conflict for each stakeholder and propose a mapping of inconsistencies.
- Identify the drivers to provide a comprehensive business case for the definition of ambitious regional SEAPs.
- Assess if the financial instruments are planned and approved.
- Provide recommendations for improving the regional SEAP in terms of methodology for its revision as well as priority areas.

The report of the review analysis will be discussed with the regional authorities and serve as basis for COOPENERGY activities.

5. Regional situation in energy planning

5.1 General information

The Liguria Region structure is composed by a regional council and four Provincial councils: at the moment the Provincial councils in charge are just two because for the other two Provinces high commissioners are put in place. Moreover the national administrative units are currently being revised and there is no guarantee that the organ of the provinces will be maintained.

➤ Energy planning responsibilities at regional level

Please indicate the areas of responsibilities of your regional government in relation with energy. Please indicate (YES/NO). If YES please describe.

- Public buildings (schools,..): YES, the regional government is responsible for the public buildings but just for their own properties like the health care ones. Usually the Schools are provincial or municipal in Italy.
- Public transport: NO.
- Energy network infrastructures (planning, operation,.): NO.
- Local energy production (planning, authorisation, operation,..): YES, the regional government is responsible for the energy planning and for the big plants authorizations.
- Energy and GHG monitoring: YES, the regional government has to prepare its own Energy Plan but the GHG monitoring on the regional burden Sharing is a national responsibility. The Liguria region has prepared however an its own Plan on the Air Quality.
- Land use and spatial planning: YES, at the regional level there is the Regional Territorial Plan that presents the vision of the regional territory on the whole and it's currently being revised; at the provincial level there are the Territorial Plans of Landscape Coordination; finally the details planning of the land use is in charge to the Municipalities through their Municipal Development Plan.
-

➤ Regional SEAP and Covenant of Mayors

What is the name of the "regional SEAP"?

- PEAR- Energy and Environment Regional Plan.

When was it established?

- The Plan is established in 2003.

Does it need to be revised, if yes when?

- The Liguria Region is now revising this Plan with the support of ARE Liguria.

Are there any Covenant Of Mayors coordinating structures in your region? Please describe.

- Yes, in the Liguria region there are 3 Coordinating Structure, they are three of the four provinces of the Region.

How many CoM signatories are present in your region?

- Almost 100.

5.2 Cooperation between national and regional levels:

To what extent are National public authorities involved, support or can influence energy planning activities at regional and local levels?

- The regional laws and the regional planning have to incorporate for sure the national level laws but they also can be more restrictive.

Are there any collaboration processes in place between the National and Regional levels that support the design and/or implementation of the regional and local SEAPs? This could include for instance setting up a regulatory framework supporting a joint definition process, a joint awareness raising campaign, a national level financial instrument supporting regional level investment. Please describe.

- There are some initiatives promoted by the Ministry of Environment such as the Sustainable Energy for Italy within the European Sustainable Energy Europe campaign that aims to improve the awareness of the energy issues.

5.3 Cooperation between regional and local levels:

➤ **Content of the regional SEAP**

What are the 3 main sectors targeted by the “regional SEAP”? (e.g: building retrofitting, sustainable mobility).

- The main sectors are the Renewable Energy Sources, the energy efficiency, the green economy development and the training and information.

What is the level of recommendations/actions at regional level/joint actions between regional and local levels, proposed within the regional SEAP?

- In the first version of 2003 there was no section about that; in the new revised version the recommendations section will be included through a “bottom up” approach, taking into account of the specific needs and potentials of the territories.

Does the regional SEAP include an estimated budget for implementing the recommendations/actions?

- No, but the social and economic effects are evaluated and the new Regional Plan will be linked to the Structural Funds 2014-2020.

Does the regional SEAP provide recommendations or measures for addressing interrelated measures such as a change in land use, sharing of sustainable energy resources or development of new financial models?

- The new Regional Plan will be subjected to a Strategic Environmental Assessment that foresees the evaluation of the interactions with other regional or higher-level plans (including European laws). For the consultation phase the departments with skills related to energy will be involved (such as Agriculture, Environment, Urban Planning, Education and training, Public Works).

Does the regional SEAP provide recommendations for implementing joint sustainable energy planning tools between the regional and local levels (see COOPENERGY pillars)? If yes, please specify.

- The new Regional Plan will include a participatory process not only in the preparation phase but also in the implementation phase (actions of energy efficiency on public buildings, public lighting, use of Renewable Energy Sources) and in the monitoring phase. The Plan will provide recommendations useful for the planning of the structural funds that could be used by the Municipalities to implement SEAPs' actions.

➤ **Regional SEAP design and approval process**

What was the process followed for designing the “regional SEAP”?

- The new Regional SEAP will be subjected to specific evaluation procedures such as the Strategic Environmental Assessment. This specific assessment consists of the following phases:
 1. Preparation of the draft Environmental Report- Max duration 90 days;

Deliverable D2.4- Regional review report – ARE Liguria

2. Public consultations; the documents for the consultation will be available at the Regional Environment Department and on the website www.areliguria.it – Max duration 60 days;
3. Assessment of the Environmental Report and of the public consultations' effects- Max duration 90 days;
4. Decision phase; the final decision will be published on the website of Liguria Region and will contain the final approved Plan;
5. Monitoring phase; it's a strategic tool that will be in charge for all the duration of the Plan in order to check the objectives of the Plan.

The COOPENERGY project, through the establishment of appropriate working groups, will contribute to design the new Regional SEAP.

How was the regional public authority represented and involved?

- The regional Plan is prepared by the Liguria Region with the support of ARE Liguria.

How were the local public authorities represented and involved?

- The indications of the Plan will be shared with the Local Authorities that will be involved in the consultation phase of the Strategic Environmental Assessment of the plan. Moreover through the Memorandum of Understanding for the Covenant of Mayors (whose Steering Committee and working groups will be developed within COOPENERGY project) the needs of the Local Authorities will be collected.

Were other regional stakeholders represented and involved during the design process?

- The new Regional Plan foresees the energy efficiency in the production processes and in the companies. It's also relevant the evaluation of the social and economics effects in order to promote the buildings sector revamp.

What were the different phases followed for designing the “regional SEAP”? How long did it take?

- See above. However it will take at least 8 months more or less only for procedures phases.

Was the National level involved?

- The National Plans and laws are taken into account but they are no directly involved.

What was the process followed for approving the “regional SEAP”?

Deliverable D2.4- Regional review report – ARE Liguria

- See above.

Who approved the regional SEAP within the regional authority?

- The Regional Council is in charge to approve the Regional Plan.

Did any local public authority representatives approve the regional SEAP?

- They are involved in the consultation phases but they are not directly involved in approval procedure.

Did any other regional stakeholders approve the regional SEAP? If yes, please specify.

- No, but there are some stakeholders (such as the Provinces, the National Municipalities Association, the Energy Agency for the protection of the regional environment, the Government Department responsible for landscapes, representatives of the Public parks, trade associations..) that participate in the consultation phases.

Were there any communication activities implemented following the approval of the regional SEAP?

- If yes, please specify who was involved? YES, the Plan will be published online and in paper version beside presented in various meetings and seminars.

➤ **Needs of local and regional public authorities**

This section is based on the feedback from regional and local public authorities.

Public authorities interviewed:

Liguria Region – Head of Research, Innovation and Energy Department, 25/09/2013

Name: Regional Authority

Question 1: In your case, what are the benefits and dis-benefits of implementing a collaboration process in sustainable energy planning between the regional and local levels?

Please identify and discuss at least 3 benefits and 3 dis-benefits.

Benefits

A working collaboration process between local and regional level could allow to collect the needs and the opportunities of all the territories and acquire information with a bottom up approach.

Deliverable D2.4- Regional review report – ARE Liguria

- Collaboration is also needed to avoid duplication and ensure the coherence of policies, sharing together knowledge and the available tools, creating a joint approach towards energy and climate policies in the region.
- Through efficient collaboration process is possible a better and more efficient allocation of resources, including economies of scale.

Dis-Benefits

- Of course a working collaboration process between local and regional level could need time and costs money but there are not specific dis-benefits if the regional objectives (also coming from the national law) will continue to be clear: a regional oversight with contributions by the Local Authorities.

Question 2: Considering the existing regional SEAP, what are the potential conflict areas or inconsistencies (due to the lack of cooperation) that could prevent its successful implementation? Or prevent the implementation of the local SEAPs? Please provide details about the targeted area, reasons for the potential conflict and inconsistency.

- Considering the existing regional SEAP (the old Regional Plan) the phase of monitoring and its possible review on the basis of the monitoring, was missing: this step will be included in the new Regional Plan and will be based on the collaboration between the Region and the Local Authorities.

Question 3: What recommendations would you like to suggest to improve the cooperation in sustainable energy planning between the regional and local levels?

In order to improve the collaboration between regional and local level it would be needed:

- a permanent steering committee involving municipalities having different size;
- pilot projects;
- dedicated structures to give technical support and follow out the municipalities (especially the smallest ones) in the implementation of their strategic projects.

➤ Needs of local and regional public authorities

Public authorities interviewed:

Municipality of Genoa – Head of Energy Department, 16/10/2013

Name: Local Authority

Question 1: In your case, what are the benefits and dis-benefits of implementing a collaboration process in sustainable energy planning between the regional and local levels?

Please identify and discuss at least 3 benefits and 3 dis-benefits.

Benefits

- A working collaboration process between local and regional level could allow the definition of joint objectives and of the useful tools to realize them at the same time; the regional level, through its law-making role, could address to the Municipalities providing guidelines on specific issues like the identification of areas dedicated to RES development and the simplification of the authorization's procedures.
- A working collaboration process between local and regional level could also allow to avoid duplication and ensure the coherence of policies, sharing together knowledge and the available tools.
- A working collaboration process between local and regional level could allow the sharing of know-how and best practices examples from other Municipalities.

Dis-Benefits

In a model of cooperation that works there are no disadvantages.

Question 2: Considering your SEAP, what are the potential conflict areas or inconsistencies (due to the lack of cooperation) that could prevent its successful implementation? Or prevent the implementation of the local SEAPs? Please provide details about the targeted area, reasons for the potential conflict and inconsistency. (The Municipality has no knowledge about the Regional Plan).

- In general the limited resources' allocation for the energy/RES activities. Nevertheless the Municipality of Genoa, as the capital of the Liguria Region, represents a specific case, having for sure more financial and decision-making independence than the smaller municipalities that represent the majority in the region.

Question 3: What recommendations would you like to suggest to improve the cooperation in sustainable energy planning between the regional and local levels?

- Responsibilities of both partner (regional and local level) on energy planning need to be clearly defined and mutually agreed through the implementation of long-term agreements like Memorandum of Cooperation mutually signed by Regional and Local Authorities.
- When available on the territory, the Regional/Provincial Energy Agencies could represent an important intermediate actor between the regional and the local levels; they also should be included in cooperation processes.

➤ **Needs of local and regional public authorities**

Public authorities interviewed:

Municipality of Varese Ligure (SP)- Mayor, 25/09/2013

Name: Local Authority

Question 1: In your case, what are the benefits and dis-benefits of implementing a collaboration process in sustainable energy planning between the regional and local levels?

Please identify and discuss at least 3 benefits and 3 dis-benefits.

Benefits

- A working collaboration process between local and regional level could allow the definition of joint objectives and of the useful tools to realize them at the same time. All the decisional levels need to agree on these objectives.
- Collaboration is also needed in order to arrange dedicated structures with regional technicians to support the municipalities (especially the smaller ones) in their energy choices; so the local authorities could avoid to commit themselves just to external consultants.
- A working collaboration process between local and regional level could also allow to avoid duplication and ensure the coherence of policies, to share knowledge and available tools.

Dis-Benefits

In a model of cooperation that works (where everyone is committed to the common objectives) there are no disadvantages, the time and money needed are well spent.

Question 2: Considering your SEAP, what are the potential conflict areas or inconsistencies (due to the lack of cooperation) that could prevent its successful implementation? Or prevent the implementation of the local SEAPs? Please provide details about the targeted area, reasons for the potential conflict and inconsistency. (The Municipality has no knowledge about the Regional Plan).

- In general the limited resources' allocation for the energy/RES activities.
- Since SEAP is a long term process, is not of high interest to the politicians that are not so involved in it. In fact there is not the same time frame between the objectives of SEAP and the mandate of the politicians. The involvement of the whole municipal organizational structure (i.e as happens for other tools like the European Energy Award- eea certification) could improve the SEAP's actions implementation.
- The cooperation agreements need to be formalized between the institutions since the collaboration processes are often linked to the persons.

Question 3: What recommendations would you like to suggest to improve the cooperation in sustainable energy planning between the regional and local levels?

- Since collaboration processes need to take time and money there should be resources allocated for this aim especially for the small municipalities.
- Responsibilities of both partner (regional and local level) need to be clearly defined and mutually agreed.
- Improvement in the definition of joint objectives and of the tools for their realization at the same time. These objectives have to be linked to the analysis of the needs, the opportunities and the potentials of who actually live the territory through consultations, meetings and surveys on site.

➤ Needs of local and regional public authorities

Public authorities interviewed:

Municipality of Noli (SV) – Mayor, 02/10/2013

Name: Local Authority

Question 1: In your case, what are the benefits and dis-benefits of implementing a collaboration process in sustainable energy planning between the regional and local levels?

Please identify and discuss at least 3 benefits and 3 dis-benefits.

Benefits

- Collaboration is needed in order to arrange dedicated structures with regional technicians to support the municipalities (especially the smaller ones) in their energy choices since they often miss specific skills in technical issues.
- A working collaboration process between local and regional level could also allow to avoid duplication and ensure the coherence of policies, to share knowledge and available tools.
- Through efficient collaboration process is possible a better and more efficient allocation of resources, including economies of scale.

Dis-Benefits

In a model of cooperation that works there are no disadvantages.

Question 2: Considering your SEAP, what are the potential conflict areas or inconsistencies (due to the lack of cooperation) that could prevent its successful implementation? Or prevent the implementation of the local SEAPs? Please provide details about the targeted area, reasons for the potential conflict and inconsistency. (The Municipality has no knowledge about the Regional Plan).

- Lack of actual resources in the Local Authority since national laws (Stability Act) limit investments by the Municipality even if of small size; the Region could be use its authority to make regional laws to solve this barrier.
- Missing cooperation with Energy Stakeholders since their lack of interest in participating in SEAPs actions.

Question 3: What recommendations would you like to suggest to improve the cooperation in sustainable energy planning between the regional and local levels?

- Since collaboration processes need to take time and money there should be resources allocated for this aim especially for the small municipalities.



Deliverable D2.4- Regional review report – ARE Liguria

- Pilot projects financed by regional permanent funds.
- Region has to make available its skills to keep informed the municipalities about the existing calls for financing and give them the chance to engage these calls.

6. Synthesis

6.1 SWOT analysis of sustainable energy planning situation within your region

<p>Strengths</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Regional Energy Planning focused on RES development and energy efficiency; the supported policies are in line with the European and National laws and with the National subsidies (energy account for photovoltaic and thermal sources, white certificates, tax deductions..). - Ligurian territory resources: biomass resources are available within the region, orientation and climate conditions are advantageous for solar photovoltaic and thermal systems and energy efficiency. - The Energy Plan is an occasion to promote the regional economical development in sectors like the Green Economy and Energy Efficiency. <p>Regional presence of companies but also of research and technological innovation centres linked to energy issues.</p>	<p>Weaknesses</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Difficulties in building up a reliable framework of the regional energy situation about the thermal RES exploitation (biomass and solar thermal systems). - Heterogeneous situation in local communities: some of them are very advanced with approved SEAP and energy policies already launched, others less advanced, with a lack of qualified technical staff in the field of energy planning and of commitments in energy issues. - Territory full of protected areas and of landscape historical restrictions that limit the possibility of action.
<p>Opportunities</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The next Regional Plan may provide some sort of guidelines for the use of the Structural Funds 2014-2020. - Good success of the Covenant of Mayors initiative in Liguria Region: about 100 signatories so far. - Process already started by the Liguria Region in order to coordinate the initiatives of sustainable energy planning in its territory. 	<p>Threats</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Progressive reductions of public subsidies. - Insufficient awareness of the citizens about the potential benefits of the RES exploitation and of the energy efficiency actions. - Economic crisis that reduces the investments' possibilities of citizens, companies and Local Authorities.

6.2 Recommendations for collaborative sustainable energy planning based on results of regional SWOT-analysis

- Bottom up approach in the phases of: definitions of Plan's objectives, their monitoring and their re-calibration after the analysis of the achieved results.
- Necessity of periodical meetings with Local Authorities in order to collect the needs and the potentials of the territory.
- Bring together the available tools from the different Energy Stakeholders to build up shared knowledge.
- Strengthen the communication process towards citizens and companies especially about the benefits of the RES exploitation and the financial opportunities at national and regional level.